

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION**

Wednesday, November 20, 2019

5:00 pm

Council Boardroom

City Hall, One Batavia City Centre, Batavia NY

AGENDA

- I. Call to Order**
- II. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes – October 2019**
- III. Review of Applications Completeness: none**
- IV. Proposals: none**
- V. Communications Sent and Received:**
 - A. Letter from Larry Barnes for 10 West Main Street**
- VI. Old Business:**
 - A. Visit to 434 East Main Street on 10/28/19**
- VII. New Business:**
 - A. New member – Alexis Green**
 - B. Meeting dates for 2020**
- VIII. Adjournment:**

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Unofficial Minutes

Monday, October 7, 2019

5:00 pm

City Hall, One Batavia City Centre, Batavia New York

Members Present: *Sharon Burkel, Connie Boyd, Caroline Hosek, Henry Emmans, and Ryan Duffy*

Others Present: Janice Smith – Recording Secretary

I. Call to order:

The meeting was opened at 5:02 pm by Chairman Sharon Burkel.

II. Approval of minutes:

Motion by: Connie Boyd

Motion was made to approve the meeting minutes for September 2019.

Seconded by: Caroline Hosek

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

III. Public Hearings:

A. 201 East Main Street – Expansion of mural and to install metal grate

- 1. Overview of the project.** Ms. Hosek read the proposal. GOART! is requesting the mural that was approved for the entrance of the musical garden be extended throughout the rest of the garden, and to install a metal grate for safety.

- 2. Public Hearing.**

Motion by: Ryan Duffy

Motion was made to open the public hearing at 5:05 pm.

Seconded by: Connie Boyd

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

GOART's Executive Director, Mr. Hallock, was there representing GOART!. He stated that the mural has been a huge success because when people see the mural on the driveway, they walk right into the garden. The current mural has a wave in it. The sidewalk has the same type of wave throughout the garden. He would like the mural to continue through the garden, because it would blend together. Also, it would keep people walking through the garden.

Mr. Hallock explained that there were kids playing the other day and he saw that they were in the window well. He realized that this could be a huge liability. The window has bars on it, but his concern is that children's hands or feet could fit between the bars and break the glass. The metal grate will have GOART!'s logo on it, and it will cover the window well. The color will be black, the same as the bench directly across from it.

After seeing the children in the garden, it was recommended to Mr. Hallock to add a lock to the plug, and to raise the lights. The can lights that GOART! originally proposed to the Commission were can lights that are flush with the ground. Mr. Hallock would like to change them from a can light in the ground to a 3' high pole light. The concern is that children would stomp on the lights and break them. Mr. Hallock has also decided that the garden needs to have a list of rules listed. He stated that he will have a small sign zip tied to the gate so that people can see the rules when they enter the garden.

Public Hearing closed at 5:14 pm

3. Discussion and Action by the Commission

Motion by: Connie Boyd

Motion was made to approve the project.

Seconded by: Ryan Duffy

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

B. 434 East Main Street – Porches, painting and windows.

- 1. Overview of the project.** Ms. Hosek read the proposal. GCASA (Genesee Council on Alcoholism and Substance Abuse, Inc.) recently bought this property. They would like to refinish the porches, paint the whole outside of the house, and replace the windows.

- 2. Remove Project from the table.**

Motion by: Connie Boyd

Motion was made to take the application off the table.

Seconded by: Ryan Duffy

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

- 3. Discussion and Action by the Commission.**

GCASA's Executive Director, Mr. Bennett, was there to explain the project for GCASA. During the last meeting the Commission asked Mr. Bennett to bring a sample of the window. Mr. Bennett showed a sample of a white vinyl window. Mr. Bennett explained that it comes in white or almond and showed a piece of paper with the colors. Ms. Hosek stated that the white was not as bright as she thought it would be. Mr. Bennett explained that he would be replacing all the wood windows on the first and second floor to vinyl windows.

Ms. Burkel asked if there were 29 windows or 39, because there were two different numbers used in the proposal. Mr. Bennett stated that there are 29 windows that will be replaced. Mr. Bennett also explained that he will replace four oriel windows with vinyl oriel windows. He plans on reglazing all the windows on the third floor. There are three stain-glass windows. He plans on repairing them. He would like to put a storm window over them. Ms. Burkel asked if he had thought of putting the

storm on the inside of the window. Mr. Bennett explained that there isn't much room and he will be putting them on the outside.

Mr. Bennett stated to keep the look in kind he would trim out the window sills with red paint since the wood windows are currently painted red. The commission thought that was a great idea.

Mr. Bennett said the pipe railing on the front porch will remain the same. The back porch will also keep the current pipe railing. On the back porch the tongue and groove decking will be replaced with tongue and groove. The house will be painted the same three colors that are on it now and the scroll work will be kept the same.

Motion by: Sharon Burkel

Motion was made to approve the project which includes:

- Front Porch - wood tongue and groove floor, wood wainscot ceiling, posts wrapped with fluted trim board, cedar shakes, save and reuse decorative trim, pressure treated wood for frame, keep the pipe railing
- Back Porch - wood tongue and groove floor, keep pipe railing
- Windows - replace 29 windows with double hung white vinyl on first and second floor, attic windows to be reglazed and painted same color, stain glass to be reglazed and painted same color, all arched windows will be preserved – reglazed and painted same color
- Painting whole house - keep same three colors;

Seconded by: Caroline Hosek

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

IV. Communications Sent and Received:

- A. Memo from Matt Worth.** The Commission appreciated that there is a schedule for everyone to adhere to.
- B. City Manager, Martin Moore spoke to the Commission.** Mr. Moore explained that Ellicott Station owner would be going in front of the Planning and Development Committee later this month to separate the parcel into three separate parcels. This will help with one of the housing grants that the owner is applying for.

V. Old Business: none

VI. New Business: none

VII. Adjournment

Motion by: Ryan Duffy

Motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 6:15 pm.

Seconded by: **Connie Boyd**

Vote for: 4 – (Henry Emmans left before final vote)

Vote against: 0

Janice Smith

Recording Secretary

55 River Street
Batavia, New York 14020
October 9, 2019

Dr. Martin Moore, City Manager
City Hall
Batavia, New York 14020

Dear Marti:

In my job description as City Historian, one of my duties is to engage in historic preservation. It is in terms of that responsibility that I am writing this letter.

After years of discussion, it appears that the City is about to move ahead on relocating the Police Department, most likely in a new building. This, of course, raises a question. What is to become of the Department's current headquarters, the former Brisbane Mansion? In addressing the answer to that question, I feel that it is important that we consider the historic significance of this structure.

The Brisbane Mansion was built in 1855 by George Brisbane, a son of James and Mary Brisbane. James Brisbane was employed by the Holland Land Company when Western New York was surveyed under the direction of Joseph Ellicott in the years 1797-1799. James was among the earliest settlers when Batavia was laid out in 1801. Among other things, he operated the first general store and became Batavia's first postmaster. He also was a shrewd investor and the fortune he amassed was inherited by his two sons, George and Albert. The Brisbane Mansion was funded by George's inheritance.

The Brisbane Mansion eventually passed to George's son, James Brisbane (presumably named after his grandfather). At that time, this second James Brisbane lived in New York City. Apparently having no desire to again live in his childhood home, he sold the mansion, along with the land which now makes up Austin Park, to the City of Batavia in late 1917.

The City fathers had no particular interest in the Brisbane Mansion and discussed tearing it down. However, in February 1918, Ellicott Hall, which stood where County Building 1 is now located, burned to the ground. This was significant in that the City was using Ellicott Hall for office space and, therefore, found itself in need of a replacement structure. This led to the decision to convert the Brisbane Mansion into a city hall. Frank H. Homelius, a noted local architect, was hired to design the conversion and in September 1918, the new city hall was

opened for inspection. The result was celebrated as an outstanding product of Homelius's genius. The building served in this altered configuration until 1964 when an addition to the rear of the mansion was built in part to house the Police Department which had been located on School Street.

Over the years, the City frequently neglected the upkeep of the structure and, sometime in the 1960s, the deteriorating cupola was quietly removed. This action resulted in a backlash from local preservationists. Consequently, in 1983, a replica of the original cupola was erected under the leadership of the Landmark Society of Genesee County.

In 2004, a part of the Mall became a new city hall. However, as other city offices moved a block east, the Police Department remained in the Brisbane Mansion, expanding into some of the recently vacated space. It, of course, remains there today in a structure which, by common agreement, is less than ideally suited to the needs of the Department.

The future of the former Brisbane Mansion is of great concern to me and other individuals concerned with Batavia's heritage. It is one of the few remaining structures that represent the architectural gems of the 1800s. We have already lost the great home of Joseph Ellicott that was on West Main Street, and the mansions of Dean Richmond and Trumbull Cary on East Main Street, to say nothing of much of our downtown which was lost to Urban Renewal. Given its prominent location at the intersection of Main and Ellicott, it is one of the few remaining daily reminders of Batavia's early history and it would be nothing less than a sacrilege to lose it.

With these observations in mind, I hope that as the City considers the future of the Police Department, equal concern is given to the future of the Brisbane Mansion.

Sincerely,

Larry D. Barnes, City Historian

CC: Members of City Council
Members of the Historic Preservation Commission

Red Circles Are Suggested Dates

Yellow are 4th Wed

365 January 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
		1	2	3	4	
	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30	31

365 February 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
1						
2	3	4	5	6	7	8
9	10	11	12	13	14	15
16	17	18	19	20	21	22
23	24	25	26	27	28	29

365 March 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
10	1	2	3	4	5	6
11	8	9	10	11	12	13
12	15	16	17	18	19	20
13	22	23	24	25	26	27
14	29	30	31			

365 April 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
14			1	2	3	4
15	5	6	7	8	9	10
16	12	13	14	15	16	17
17	19	20	21	22	23	24
18	26	27	28	29	30	

365 May 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
18			1	2		
19	3	4	5	6	7	8
20	10	11	12	13	14	15
21	17	18	19	20	21	22
22	24	25	26	27	28	29
23	31					

365 June 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
23	1	2	3	4	5	6
24	7	8	9	10	11	12
25	14	15	16	17	18	19
26	21	22	23	24	25	26
27	28	29	30			

365 July 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
27			1	2	3	4
28	5	6	7	8	9	10
29	12	13	14	15	16	17
30	19	20	21	22	23	24
31	26	27	28	29	30	31

365 August 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
31						1
32	2	3	4	5	6	7
33	9	10	11	12	13	14
34	16	17	18	19	20	21
35	23	24	25	26	27	28
36	30	31				

365 September 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
36		1	2	3	4	5
37	6	7	8	9	10	11
38	13	14	15	16	17	18
39	20	21	22	23	24	25
40	27	28	29	30		

365 October 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
40				1	2	3
41	4	5	6	7	8	9
42	11	12	13	14	15	16
43	18	19	20	21	22	23
44	25	26	27	28	29	30
						31

365 November 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
45	1	2	3	4	5	6
46	8	9	10	11	12	13
47	15	16	17	18	19	20
48	22	23	24	25	26	27
49	29	30				

365 December 2020

Sun	Mon	Tue	Wed	Thu	Fri	Sat
49		1	2	3	4	5
50	6	7	8	9	10	11
51	13	14	15	16	17	18
52	20	21	22	23	24	25
53	27	28	29	30	31	

17 Mar

1 Jan	New Year's Day
20 Jan	Martin Luther King Day
12 Feb	Lincoln's Birthday
14 Feb	Valentine's Day
17 Feb	Presidents Day
25 Feb	Mardi Gras Carnival
8 Mar	Daylight Saving (Start)

St. Patrick's Day

16 May	Armed Forces Day
25 May	Memorial Day
31 May	Pentecost
1 Jun	Pentecost Monday
14 Jun	Flag Day
21 Jun	Father's Day
4 Jul	Independence Day

7 Sep

11 Sep	September 11th
17 Sep	Citizenship Day
25 Sep	Native American Day
12 Oct	Columbus Day
16 Oct	Boss's Day
17 Oct	Sweetest Day

31 Oct

1 Nov	Daylight Saving (End)
11 Nov	Veterans' Day
26 Nov	Thanksgiving
7 Dec	Pearl Harbor
25 Dec	Christmas Day
31 Dec	New Year's Eve