

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## *Official Minutes*

Wednesday, September 11, 2019

5:00 pm

City Hall, One Batavia City Centre, Batavia New York

**Members Present:** *Sharon Burkel, Connie Boyd, Caroline Hosek, Henry Emmans, and Ryan Duffy*

**Others Present:** Janice Smith – Recording Secretary, Ron Panek—Code Enforcement Officer

### I. **Call to order:**

The meeting was opened at 5:01 pm by Chairman Sharon Burkel.

### II. **Approval of minutes:**

**Motion by: Ryan Duffy**

Motion was made to approve the meeting minutes for May 2019.

Seconded by: Caroline Hosek

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

### III. **Public Hearings:**

**434 East Main Street – Porch and windows.** Mr. Bennett was there to explain the project for GCASA. The proposal includes rebuilding the porches and installing replacement vinyl windows. This is a five unit apartment building for individuals who are in recovery and their families. The front porch is in really bad shape stated Mr. Bennett. Part of the porch had some water damage. Currently there are posts holding the porch up. The proposal stated that they would remove front portion of porch in its entirety and discard. Mr. Bennett explained that they would be removing all of the wood, cedar shakes and preserving the trim/scroll work. Mr. Bennett is building a code compliant porch. He will then rebuild it to look like the original with cedar shakes and use the trim that was saved.

Mr. Panek brought up that the proposal also included using deck boards on the porch. Mr. Bennett explained that he is keeping it in kind and will use tongue and groove. The proposal stated that they would be replacing the ceiling with vinyl wainscot but Mr. Bennett stated that it would be wood.

Ms. Burkel stated that the proposal doesn't state the materials that will be used for the front porch posts. The 4x4 posts would wrap with a fluted trim board, which is normally made out of poplar. They will save the gingerbread.

Ms. Hosek asked Mr. Bennett what materials he is using on the ceiling because the proposal stated that it will be vinyl. Mr. Bennett explained that they will be replacing the porch ceiling board by board and that it would be a painted wood, not vinyl.

Mr. Panek explained to Mr. Bennett that if he is to keep the porch in kind, it means that he will need to use wood wainscot, tongue and groove deck, and the cedar shakes. Mr. Bennett explained that they will rebuild the front porch exactly the way it is. He would like to use pressure treated wood for the frame work, but everything else will be rebuilt exactly the way it is.

Mr. Bennett explained that in the back of the property there is a back porch and a small stoop. Mr. Bennett is having the tongue and groove floor replaced on the back porch. They plan on keeping that in kind. Mr. Bennett suggested he may add a railing with spindles to the back porch. He will use spindles that match that era. Ms. Burkel stated that the commission would like to see the profile of the spindle for the porch railings. Mr. Panek explained that houses in that era had just an iron pipe as a railing. Mr. Panek stated there is no requirement from the code for a railing since it is less than 30” high. Mr. Bennett did not indicate what he intended to do regarding a railing.

Mr. Bennett explained that they would like to replace some of the windows with vinyl. The windows in the attic they plan on reglazing and keeping the original windows. All of the stained glass windows they plan on keeping as they are. Mr. Bennett is requesting to replace all the windows that are in the heated area with white vinyl windows. The larger windows they will replace with vinyl and keep them similar. For example, if they have grids they will be replaced with the grids; if there are no grids, then the replacement will have no grids; the over size of the window will stay the same. Mr. Bennett stated that there are two arched windows and they plan on preserving both of them.

Ms. Burkel expressed that she was concerned about the white vinyl because currently the windows are wood that is painted red. Mr. Bennett stated that GCASA has a small budget and he would not be able to afford wood windows. The windows are different sizes and different types. Ms. Burkel stated that she would really like to see what the profile and the color of the window would be. A white window will really “pop” versus if Mr. Bennett could get a gray or an off color white. Ms. Burkel is asking which windows will be double hung and which ones are not because, there are a lot of different size windows and different ways that GCASA is replacing them. The windows will be the same as they are now but the sashes will not be red. Mr. Bennett explained that he will ask about a small profile and see if he can get any other colors than white.

Mr. Bennett then described some of what he plans to do to the inside and how they will be remodeling the different apartments. Ms. Burkel explained that the HPC is only interested in the outside. Mr. Bennett said that he is having Stafford painters come and paint the whole property. They are keeping it the same colors. Painting will be scheduled for this fall, but after the windows are put in, because new windows have to be caulked.

Ms. Burkel stated that this is a very significant house. Ms. Burkel believes that Mr. Bennett and GCASA have done a wonderful job at keeping their properties looking nice. It is the job of the HPC to keep a house looking to the original appearance as possible. Before they can make a decision they need more information. Mr. Bennett asked if before they do the windows if the Commission would like to see the profile of the window, and material of the window. Ms. Burkel stated that they would like to help GCASA make the best decisions for their budget. Mr. Emmans asked that Mr. Bennett bring back a listing of the window and what he would replace them with. Mr. Duffy would like to know more information. Mr. Bennett explained that the

windows are an essential part of the project and nothing can get done until the windows have been installed. Ms. Burkel stated since the windows are the most important part of the project, it should put this on hold until Mr. Bennett provides that information.

**Motion by: Ryan Duffy**

Motion was made to table the application as proposed.

Seconded by: Henry Emmans

Vote for: 5

Abstained: 0

Vote against: 0

**IV. Communications Sent and Received: none**

**V. Old Business:**

**A. Redfield Pillars RFP.** Ms. Burkel stated that Catenary Construction won the bid of repairing the Redfield Pillars. Ms. Burkel has seen the work done by Bill Farmer who is associated with Catenary Construction and he will do a good job. Ms. Burkel asked about the contract time which is mid –spring 2020 that the pillars have to be done. According to Ms. Burkel the original lights were taken out during the Main Street reconstruction project. Ms. Burkel would like to see the original lights back in the pillars.

**VI. New Business: none**

**VII. Adjournment**

**Motion by: Connie Boyd**

Motion was made to adjourn the meeting at 5:54 pm.

Seconded by: Caroline Hosek

Vote for: 5

Vote against: 0

---

Janice Smith  
Recording Secretary